

## Abandoning the Ground Game? Field Organization in the 2016 Election

### Supplemental Appendix

**Table A1.** Difference in counties containing field offices in 2012 and 2016, by 2016 battleground states.

	Counties with Obama field office, 2012	Counties with a Clinton field office, 2016	Change in counties with a field office, 2012 to 2016
Colorado	28	16	-12
Florida	34	27	-7
Iowa	51	23	-28
Michigan	17	15	-2
Nevada	3	5	2
New Hampshire	10	10	0
North Carolina	39	29	-10
Ohio	63	50	-13
Pennsylvania	28	33	5
Virginia	45	29	-16
Wisconsin	43	30	-13
Swing-state total	361	267	-94
Nation overall	457	339	-118

**Table A2.** Self-reported campaign contact by field office presence in county of either or both the Clinton and Trump campaigns in 2016. Results of logistic regression represented as odds ratios.

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
	Any contact	In person	Phone call	E-mail or text	Letter or postcard
Clinton office	1.114*	1.145	0.991	1.031	0.968
	(0.050)	(0.100)	(0.045)	(0.039)	(0.069)
Trump office	1.110	0.906	1.124	1.057	0.943
	(0.124)	(0.314)	(0.122)	(0.157)	(0.066)
Both Clinton and Trump office	0.960	1.265	0.899	1.091	1.089
	(0.086)	(0.459)	(0.139)	(0.172)	(0.093)
Battleground state	1.488*	1.161	1.506*	0.877*	1.182*
	(0.126)	(0.155)	(0.144)	(0.056)	(0.070)
Registered voter	1.206*	1.580*	1.116	0.722*	1.408*
	(0.055)	(0.180)	(0.118)	(0.052)	(0.117)
Voted in 2012	1.751*	1.075	1.348*	1.447*	1.782*
	(0.082)	(0.050)	(0.084)	(0.075)	(0.093)
Age in years	1.024*	0.987*	1.018*	1.005*	1.008*
	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.001)	(0.002)
Female	0.932*	0.979	1.129*	0.733*	0.918*
	(0.024)	(0.035)	(0.035)	(0.017)	(0.025)
Black	0.940	1.006	1.023	0.816*	0.587*
	(0.047)	(0.094)	(0.061)	(0.036)	(0.031)
Hispanic	0.865*	0.887	0.909	0.757*	0.653*
	(0.045)	(0.068)	(0.098)	(0.048)	(0.038)
Asian	0.715*	0.849	0.920	0.795*	0.759*
	(0.042)	(0.116)	(0.113)	(0.066)	(0.066)
Other race	1.245*	1.114	0.975	1.375*	1.121*
	(0.074)	(0.119)	(0.084)	(0.127)	(0.064)
Current union household	1.418*	1.462*	0.979	0.899	0.905*
	(0.054)	(0.118)	(0.059)	(0.057)	(0.043)
Former union household	1.126*	1.083*	0.979	1.034	1.030
	(0.017)	(0.026)	(0.021)	(0.019)	(0.020)
Self or family members in military	1.367*	0.986	0.969	1.108*	1.175*
	(0.036)	(0.038)	(0.029)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Own home	1.119*	1.305*	1.377*	0.672*	1.144*
	(0.029)	(0.095)	(0.057)	(0.025)	(0.043)
Born again	0.944	0.971	0.902*	0.839*	0.943
	(0.036)	(0.056)	(0.038)	(0.029)	(0.031)
B.A. degree or higher	1.488*	1.139*	0.910*	1.611*	1.315*
	(0.037)	(0.054)	(0.033)	(0.051)	(0.031)
Below average income	0.769*	0.984	0.866*	0.783*	0.869*
	(0.022)	(0.034)	(0.028)	(0.019)	(0.029)
Married	1.006	1.230*	1.083*	0.866*	0.978
	(0.025)	(0.056)	(0.042)	(0.028)	(0.028)
Constant	0.133*	0.181*	0.552*	1.491*	0.269*
	(0.019)	(0.027)	(0.077)	(0.156)	(0.034)
Observations	42,938	24,340	24,340	24,340	24,340

*Note.* Model (except for interaction of candidates) from Masket, Sides, Vavreck 2016. Robust standard errors in parentheses. Coefficients that can be distinguished from 0 ( $\alpha < 0.05$  two-tailed) are marked with an asterisk (\*).

**Table A3.** Variables predicting Democratic vote increase, 2012-2016, and variables predicting Clinton's share of the two-party vote, 2016. Analysis modeled after Masket (2009).

	(1) Democratic vote difference, 2012-2016	(2) Clinton share of two-party vote, 2016
Clinton county field office, 2016	0.998 (0.628)	1.684* (0.316)
Obama county field office, 2012	0.813* (0.314)	
Clinton office X Obama 2012 office	0.334 (0.704)	
Trump county field office, 2016		0.403 (0.846)
Clinton office X Trump Office		1.049 (0.945)
Change in unemployment, 2015-2016	-0.990* (0.282)	-1.099* (0.308)
Percent population growth, 2012-2015	0.152* (0.033)	0.172* (0.036)
Percent African American	11.857* (1.282)	9.560* (1.399)
Percent Hispanic	-1.629 (1.728)	-2.425 (1.883)
Median age	-0.130* (0.023)	-0.176* (0.024)
Median income	0.147* (0.010)	0.175* (0.011)
County population (in thousands)	2.495* (0.534)	1.662* (0.635)
Obama share of two-party vote, 2012	-0.083* (0.012)	0.976* (0.013)
Constant	-6.124* (1.340)	-5.993* (1.470)
Observations	800	800
R-squared	0.726	0.953

*Note.* Cell entries are fixed-effects regression coefficients, controlling for state, predicting the increase in the Democratic share of the two-party presidential vote between 2004 and 2008. Statistically significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) coefficients are indicated by an asterisk.

**Table A4.** Models of Clinton's county-level share of the two-party vote in 2016. Analysis modeled after Masket, Sides and Vavreck (2016).

	(1)	(2)	(3)
Clinton field office only	0.987*		
	(0.223)		
Trump field office only	0.128		
	(0.166)		
Clinton office x Trump office	-0.003		
	(0.285)		
Number of Clinton offices (0, 1, 2+)		0.783*	
		(0.197)	
Number of Trump offices (0, 1, 2+)		-0.110	
		(0.204)	
Clinton offices minus Trump offices			0.341*
			(0.129)
Neither Clinton nor Trump office			-0.533*
			(0.262)
Population growth, 2012-2015	0.037*	0.037*	0.038*
	(0.016)	(0.016)	(0.017)
Total number of residents (in millions)	0.432	0.390	0.432
	(0.280)	(0.285)	(0.288)
Percentage African-American	0.165*	0.165*	0.165*
	(0.014)	(0.014)	(0.014)
Percentage Hispanic	0.097*	0.098*	0.098*
	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)
Percentage under 18	0.117*	0.118*	0.118*
	(0.035)	(0.035)	(0.035)
Median income (in thousands)	-0.012	-0.013	-0.013
	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)
Obama vote share in 2012	0.867*	0.867*	0.868*
	(0.016)	(0.016)	(0.016)
Percentage with no high school degree	0.101*	0.099*	0.099*
	(0.032)	(0.032)	(0.032)
Percentage with a bachelor's degree	0.449*	0.450*	0.454*
	(0.031)	(0.031)	(0.031)
Increase in unemployment, 2015-2016	-0.257	-0.252	-0.250
	(0.160)	(0.159)	(0.159)
Constant	-15.964*	-15.916*	-15.462*
	(1.209)	(1.212)	(1.233)
Observations	3,109	3,109	3,109
R-squared	0.983	0.983	0.983

*Note.* Cell entries are ordinary least squares regression coefficients, with standard errors clustered by state in parentheses. The models also include fixed effects for state. The dependent variable is the Democratic share of the two-party presidential vote. Statistically significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) coefficients are indicated by an asterisk.

**Table A5.** Effect of field offices on 2016 Voter Turnout at County Level, Ordinary Least Squares Regression. Analysis modeled according to Weinschenk (2015).

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Total Field Offices	-0.038 (0.037)			
Clinton Field Offices		-0.084 (0.052)		-0.148* (0.069)
Trump Field Offices			0.137 (0.120)	0.311 (0.161)
2012 Turnout	0.829* (0.040)	0.829* (0.040)	0.829* (0.040)	0.829* (0.040)
Median Age	0.192* (0.035)	0.192* (0.035)	0.193* (0.035)	0.193* (0.035)
Median Income	0.033* (0.006)	0.033* (0.006)	0.033* (0.006)	0.033* (0.006)
Percent African American	-0.064* (0.006)	-0.063* (0.006)	-0.064* (0.006)	-0.063* (0.006)
Percent Latino	-0.032* (0.007)	-0.032* (0.007)	-0.033* (0.007)	-0.032* (0.007)
Percent with College Degree	0.059* (0.019)	0.060* (0.019)	0.057* (0.019)	0.059* (0.019)
Constant	-0.169 (0.635)	-0.188 (0.635)	-0.144 (0.633)	-0.205 (0.631)
Observations	3,109	3,109	3,109	3,109
R-squared	0.944	0.945	0.944	0.945

*Note.* Cell entries are ordinary least squares regression coefficients, with standard errors clustered by state in parentheses. The models also include fixed effects for state. The dependent variable is the Democratic share of the two-party presidential vote. Statistically significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) coefficients are indicated by an asterisk.

### Appendix B: Question Wording, 2016 CCES

Campaign contact (CC16\_425a, CC16\_425b\_1-4)

- Did a candidate or political campaign organization contact you during the 2016 election?
- How did these candidates or campaigns contact you? Check all that apply.
  - In person
  - Phone call
  - Email or text message
  - Letter or post card

Age (birthyr)

- In what year were you born?

Gender (gender)

- Are you male or female?

Race (race) [used to construct dummy variables for Black, Hispanic, Asian, and Other]

- What racial or ethnic group best describes you?
  - White
  - Black
  - Hispanic
  - Asian
  - Native American
  - Middle Eastern
  - Mixed
  - Other

Union member (union) [used to construct current and former union membership variables]

- Are you a member of a labor union?
  - Yes, I am currently a member of a labor union
  - I formerly was a member of a labor union
  - I am not now, nor have I been, a member of a labor union

Military service (milstat\_1-4) [used to construct “military” variable denoting whether a respondent is serving or served previously in the military, and whether anyone in their family has served or is serving]

- We’d like to know whether you or someone in your immediate family is currently serving or has ever served in the U.S. military. Immediate family is defined as your parents, siblings, spouse, and children. Please check all boxes that apply.
  - milstat\_1: I am
  - milstat\_2: Family
  - milstat\_3: I served previously
  - milstat\_4: Family served previously

Home owner (ownhome) [used to construct dummy homeowner variable]

- Do you own your home or pay rent?

- Own
- Rent
- Other

Born-again Christian (pew\_bornagain)

- Would you describe yourself as a born-again or evangelical Christian, or not?

Bachelor's degree or more (educ) [used to create ba\_or\_more dummy variable]

- What is the highest level of education you have completed?
  - No HS
  - High school graduate
  - Some college
  - 2-year
  - 4-year
  - Post-grad

Income below \$80,000 (faminc) [used to create inc\_below dummy variable]

- Thinking back over the last year, what was your family's annual income?
  - Less than \$10,000
  - \$10,000 - \$19,000
  - \$20,000 - \$29,000
  - \$30,000 - \$39,000
  - \$40,000 - \$49,000
  - \$50,000 - \$59,000
  - \$60,000 - \$69,000
  - \$70,000 - \$79,000
  - \$80,000 - \$89,000
  - \$90,000 - \$99,000
  - \$100,000 - \$119,000
  - ... etc.

Marital status (marstat) [used to create married dummy]

- What is your marital status?
  - Married
  - Separated
  - Divorced
  - Widowed
  - Single
  - Domestic partnership